



Progress and Plans for Energetic Particle (EP) Physics

Coll of Wm & Mary Columbia U **CompX General Atomics** FIU INL Johns Hopkins U LANL LLNL Lodestar MIT Lehigh U Nova Photonics **Old Dominion** ORNL PPPL **Princeton** U Purdue U SNL Think Tank, Inc. UC Davis UC Irvine UCLA UCSD **U** Colorado **U Illinois U** Maryland **U** Rochester **U** Tennessee U Tulsa **U** Washington **U Wisconsin** X Science LLC

Mario Podestà

Gary Taylor, Nikolai Gorelenkov

and the NSTX-U Research Team

NSTX-U PAC-35 Meeting **PPPL – B318** June 11-13, 2014





Culham Sci Ctr York U Chubu U Fukui U Hiroshima U Hvoao U Kyoto U Kyushu U Kvushu Tokai U NIFS Niigata U **U** Tokyo IAEA Inst for Nucl Res. Kiev loffe Inst TRINITI Chonbuk Natl U NFRI KAIST POSTECH Seoul Natl U ASIPP CIEMAT FOM Inst DIFFER ENEA, Frascati CEA, Cadarache **IPP**, Jülich **IPP, Garching** ASCR, Czech Rep

Office of

EP research on NSTX-U targets improved understanding & predictions for fast ion physics in ITER, FNSF

- Fast ions affect power and momentum balance, current drive in future devices
- NB ions and fusion alphas interact with RF, 3D fields, instabilities
- > Complex scenario to model

> Includes instabilities, 3D fields, RF, feedback on thermal plasma



EP research on NSTX-U targets improved understanding & predictions for fast ion physics in ITER, FNSF

- Fast ions affect power and momentum balance, current drive in future devices
- NB ions and fusion alphas interact with RF, 3D fields, instabilities
- > Complex scenario to model

> Includes instabilities, 3D fields, RF, feedback on thermal plasma

NSTX-U is well equipped to explore broad range of EP scenarios, as required for projections to ITER, FNSF



Outline

- Near-term milestones
- Research highlights
- Research goals for FY-15 and FY-16
- Summary of key activities in FY15-16





Outline

- Near-term milestones
- Research highlights
- Research goals for FY-15 and FY-16
- Summary of key activities in FY15-16



Near term goals: develop predictive/interpretive tools for *AEs and fast ion dynamics, validate against experiments

FY14 Milestone R14-2:

Develop/assess reduced models for *AE-induced fast ion transport.

FY15 Milestone R15-2:

Assess effects of NBI parameters on fast ion distribution function, NB driven current profile.

FY15 OFES Joint Research Milestone:

Quantify impact of broadened current and pressure profiles on confinement and stability.

FY16 Milestone R16-3:

Assess fast-wave SOL losses and core thermal/fast ion interactions at increased B_t and current.



6

Outline

- Near-term milestones
- Research highlights
- Research goals for FY-15 and FY-16
- Summary of key activities in FY15-16



Mapping unstable regimes guides development of discharges with reduced or suppressed MHD

- Stability range for low-f MHD mapped through M3D-K code
 - -Now comparing with NSTX data
 - -Will be used to identify stable regimes_{1.1} in NSTX-U (including ramp-up)
 - >Complements results for *AEs from experiments and simulations



B#32-36

Mode characterization through advanced codes enables interpretation of experiments, development of new tools

- Stability range for low-f MHD mapped through M3D-K code
 - -Now comparing with NSTX data
 - -Will be used to identify stable regimes_{1.1} in NSTX-U (including ramp-up)
 - >Complements results for *AEs from experiments and simulations
- HYM code shows coupling of Compressional AEs (CAEs) to Kinetic Alfvén Waves (KAWs)
 - >Mechanism for wave energy dissipation to thermal plasma
 - >HYM: essential tool for thermal transport studies on NSTX-U
- Developing tools to simulate ω~ω_{ci} antenna-driven modes
 > Preliminary runs with AORSA, TORIC (full wave) also show FW coupling to KAWs





B#32-36

Improved analysis and simulations reveal synergy between different perturbations – *tools for *AE control*



- Dynamics of bursting CAE modes modified by coupling to kinks
 Predator-prey dynamics
- AE burst frequency locks on kink
- Suggests modulation of AE stability by *low-f* perturbation

E. D. Fredrickson, PoP 2013

🔘 NSTX-U

Improved analysis and simulations reveal synergy between different perturbations - *tools for *AE control*



🔘 NSTX-U

Improved analysis and simulations reveal synergy between different perturbations - *tools for *AE control*



(III) NSTX-U

NSTX-U PAC-35 – Progress and Plans for EP Research, Podestà (06/12/2014)

Validated reduced models for EP transport; extend validation beyond present DIII-D collaboration



B#37-39

Validated reduced models for EP transport; extend validation beyond present DIII-D collaboration







(III) NSTX-U

B#37-39

Upgrade and reinstallation of critical EP diagnostics targets operations in early FY-15

Reflectometer (UCLA) – mode structure



*AE antenna – mode stability sFLIP – fast ion losses



Fusion product array (FIU) – fast ion profile, transport (pending funding)



FIDA systems (UCI) – fast ion



(() NSTX-U

B#40-41

Outline

- Near-term milestones
- Research highlights
- Research goals for FY-15 and FY-16
- Summary of key activities in FY15-16



Goals & Plans for FY-15 (1)

- Characterize fast ion distribution with 2nd NB line **R15-2**
 - Use FIDA, ssNPA, sFLIP to measure fast ion profile and losses
 - Compare with classical predictions from TRANSP
 - Benefits from upgraded modules in TRANSP (e.g. 3D "halo" model) B#42
 - Assess NB-driven current dependence on NB injection parameters
- Assess effects of broadened pressure, NB-driven current on plasma stability, performance [JRT-15]
 - Investigate effects on *AE stability
 - Compare with linear/nonlinear simulations
 - Characterize mode structure with reflectometers, BES
- Assess *AE antenna performance for damping rate measurements of lower frequency *AEs (TAEs, RSAEs)
- Characterize scenarios with combined NBI+HHFW **R16-3**
 - Assess RF power deposition on fast ions as a function of RF injected spectrum, power

Exploit close collaboration with theory (PPPL and collaborators) to meet EP Research goals:

- Validate first-principle codes for extended parameter range of NSTX-U
 - Enabled by improved description of F_{nb}, rotation
 - Target both NB-only and NB+HHFW scenarios
 - Improve estimates of RF power transfer to thermal plasma and fast ions
 - Improve simulations of *AE effects on thermal transport
- Extend validation of reduced models for EP transport by MHD (*AEs, low-f kink-like modes) [R14-2]
 - Validate Critical Gradient & "kick" models for broad range of *AE activity, NB injection parameters

>Extend predictions of MHD/*AE stability to 1T, 2MA NSTX-U scenarios

Goals & Plans for FY-16

- Assess *AE stability at full B_t, current
 - Characterize damping rate through *AE antenna
 - Compare with linear/nonlinear codes
- Extend *AE studies to nonlinear, multi-mode regimes
- Characterize F_{nb} modifications by *AEs
 - Obtain detailed measurements of F_{nb} from FIDA, ssNPA, CFPA
 - Compare experiments with first-principle & reduced models
- Contribute to non-inductive ramp-up research
 - Study *AE stability in low-l_p flat-top plasmas prototypical of ramp-up conditions
- Validate codes for GAE/CAE modes
 - Study GAE/CAE effects on electron thermal transport at higher B_t, current (w/ T&T TSG)
- > Assess requirements to affect F_{nb}, NB-driven current through available actuators (NBI, HHFW, external coils)

Outline

- Near-term milestones
- Research highlights
- Research goals for FY-15 and FY-16
- Summary of key activities in FY15-16



Summary of key activities in FY15-16

- Develop leading capabilities in non-linear and reduced models for *AE-induced transport
 - Characterize effects of 2nd NB line on F_{nb}, NB-driven current, stability
 - Investigate synergy between NBI and HHFW
 - Develop predictive tools for *AE-induced thermal electron transport
- Support non-inductive ramp-up experiments with reduced/optimized *AE activity

> Assess <u>control capability</u> of F_{nb}, current through NBI, HHFW, coils



Backup



FY14-18 Energetic Particle Research timeline Baseline & ~10-15% incremental funding (mm)



NSTX-U

NSTX-U PAC-35 – Progress and Plans for EP Research, Podestà (06/12/2014)

Facility & Control developments give access to new physics, enable projections to next-step



🔘 NSTX-U

NSTX-U PAC-35 – Progress and Plans for EP Research, Podestà (06/12/2014)

Thrust EP-1: Develop predictive tools for projections of *AE-induced fast ion transport in FNSF and ITER

- Vary fast-ion instability drive by varying:
 - NBI source to vary n_{fast}(r), fast-ion anisotropy, q, rotation
 - 3D fields to vary rotation, fast-ion transport
 - B_T , I_P , P_{NB} , and density to vary q, $v_{fast}/v_{Alfvén}$, β_{fast}/β_{tot}
- Measure *AE mode properties including radial structure, frequency and wavenumber spectrum, and stability
 - Utilize high-f magnetics, BES, reflectometry
- Characterize fast ion transport associated with specific classes of *AEs

- Utilize fast-ion D-alpha diagnostics, SSNPA, neutron rate

 Utilize linear and non-linear numerical and theoretical tools (ORBIT, NOVA-K, M3D-K, HYM) to understand mode-induced fast-ion transport in NSTX-U, ITER, FNSF

Thrust EP-2: Assess requirements for fast-ion *phase-space engineering* techniques

- Perform active spectroscopy to measure linear *AE damping rates to benchmark stability codes at low aspect ratio
 - Utilize linear stability validation in NSTX-U to improve fundamental understanding of mode drive and stability mechanisms in ITER burning plasmas and for ST-based FNSF, Pilot
- With incremental funding, upgrade driving amplifier to higher power, extend bandwidth of *AE antenna system to study high frequency modes
 - Higher-f + possible ω_{ci} resonances may provide means to controllably modify the non-thermal ion distribution function and possibly lower the overall fast ion pressure



FY14 Milestone R14-2: Develop models for *AE mode-induced fast-ion transport

Good confinement of fast ions from neutral beam injection and fusion reactions is essential for the successful operation of ST-CTF, ITER, and future reactors. Significant progress has been made in characterizing the Alfvénic modes (AEs) driven unstable by fast ions and the associated fast ion transport. However, models that can consistently reproduce fast ion transport for actual experiments, or provide predictions for new scenarios and devices, have not yet been validated against a sufficiently broad range of experiments.

In order to develop a physics-based parametric fast ion transport model that can be integrated in general simulation codes such as TRANSP, results obtained from NSTX and during collaborations with other facilities (MAST, DIII-D) will be analyzed. Information on the mode properties (amplitude, frequency, radial structure) and on the fast ion response to AEs will be deduced from Beam Emission Spectroscopy, Reflectometers, Fast-Ion D-alpha (FIDA) systems, Neutral Particle Analyzers, Fast Ion Loss Probes and neutron rate measurements.

The fast ion transport mechanisms and their parametric dependence on the mode properties will be assessed through comparison of experimental results with theory using both linear (e.g., NOVA-K) and non-linear (e.g., M3D-K, HYM) codes, complemented by gyro-orbit (ORBIT) and full-orbit (SPIRAL) particle-following codes.

Based on the general parametric model, the implementation of *reduced* models in TRANSP will then be assessed. For instance, the existing Anomalous Fast Ion Diffusion (AFID) and radial fast ion convection models in TRANSP could be improved by implementing methods to calculate those transport coefficients consistently with the measured (or simulated) mode properties. Further improvements will also be considered to include a stochastic transport term or quasi-linear models.

FY15 Milestone R15-2:

Assess the effects of neutral beam injection parameters on the fast ion distribution function and neutral beam driven current profile.

(w/ ASC, MS and SFSU TSGs)

Accurate knowledge of neutral beam (NB) ion properties is of paramount importance for many areas of tokamak physics. NB ion's modify the power balance, provide torque to drive plasma rotation and affect the behavior of MHD instabilities. Moreover, they determine the non-inductive NB driven current, which is crucial for future devices such as ITER, FNSF and STs with no central solenoid. On NSTX-U, three more tangentially-aimed NB sources have been added to the existing, more perpendicular ones. With this addition, NSTX-U is uniquely equipped to characterize a broad parameter space of fast ion distribution, F_{nb} , and NB-driven current properties, with significant overlap with conventional aspect ratio tokamaks. The two main goals of the proposed Research Milestone on NSTX-U are (i) to characterize the NB ion behavior and compare it with classical predictions, and (ii) to document the operating space of NB-driven current profile. F_{nb} will be characterized through the upgraded set of NSTX-U fast ion diagnostics (e.g. FIDA, ssNPA, sFLIP, neutron counters) as a function of NB injection parameters (tangency radius, beam voltage) and magnetic field. Well controlled, single-source scenarios at low NB power will be initially used to compare fast ion behavior with classical models (e.g. the NUBEAM module of TRANSP) in the absence of fast ion driven instabilities. Diagnostics data will be interpreted through the "beam blip" analysis technique and other dedicated codes such as FIDASIM. Then, the NB-driven current profile will be documented for the attainable NB parameter space by comparing NUBEAM/TRANSP predictions to measurements from Motional Stark Effect, complemented by the vertical/ tangential FIDA systems and ssNPA to assess modifications of the classically expected F_{nb} . As operational experience builds up in the first year of NSTX-U experiments, additions to the initial F_{nh} assessment will be considered for scenarios where deviations of F_{nh} from classical predictions can be expected. The latter may include scenarios with MHD instabilities, externally imposed non-axisymmetric 3D fields and additional Fast Wave heating.



FY16 Milestone R16-3: Assess fast-wave SOL losses and core thermal and fast ion interactions at increased field and current

Use of high-harmonic fast wave (HHFW) injection for heating and current drive in NSTX-U is important to develop non-inductive start-up/ramp-up schemes, to achieve higher plasma performance, and to validate RF codes in support of the ITER FW program. The successful exploitation of HHFW depends on how much power can be coupled to the core plasma through the scrape-off layer (SOL) and how the coupled power is partitioned between different species in the core. For NSTX-U H-mode plasmas, the latter typically include thermal electrons/ions and fast ions from Neutral Beam (NB) injection. Mechanisms responsible for RF power losses in the SOL will first be addressed to optimize FW coupling to the core as a function of excited wave spectrum, toroidal field and plasma current (B_T and I_P). For instance, full-wave simulations with the AORSA code suggest a local enhancement of RF fields for propagating (rather than evanescent) fast waves in the SOL, which results in increased losses through damping. Losses are predicted to decrease at lower SOL density and/or at higher B_{T} . AORSA predictions will be tested against improved measurements of RF fields through dedicated probe arrays. The amount of lost power will be quantified through infrared cameras. The improved understanding of SOL loss mechanisms will provide more accurate estimations of the fraction of injected HHFW power reaching the core. The synergy between NB and FW injection in H-mode plasmas will be evaluated for the higher B_{T} and I_{P} of NSTX-U. In particular, the efficiency of thermal ions heating at higher B_T , predicted to increase by full-wave simulations, will be investigated. Similarly, modifications of the fast ion distribution, previously observed on NSTX, will be assessed with the enhanced fast ion diagnostics set of NSTX-U as a function of plasma parameters, FW spectrum and NB injection geometry, including the new (more tangential) NB lines. The characterization of scenarios with combined NB and FW injection will provide a valuable dataset to benchmark RF codes (e.g. AORSA, TORIC and CQL3D-FOW), which have been considerably improved in the past years. NSTX-U will provide the required data for extensive validation before their use for scenario predictions in future devices such as ITER and FNSF.

()) NSTX-U

FY15 OFES 3 Facility Joint Research Milestone: Quantify impact of broadened current and pressure profiles on confinement and stability.

Conduct experiments and analysis to quantify the impact of broadened current and pressure profiles on tokamak plasma confinement and stability. Broadened pressure profiles generally improve global stability but can also affect transport and confinement, while broadened current profiles can have both beneficial and adverse impacts on confinement and stability. This research will examine a variety of heating and current drive techniques in order to validate theoretical models of both the actuator performance and the transport and global stability response to varied heating and current drive deposition.

Summary of theory and simulation capabilities for EP research

Code	Description	Scope	Status/improvements
ORBIT	Gyro-center particle following code.	Infer fast ion response to given set of modes.	Improved methods for resonance identification.
SPIRAL	Full-orbit particle following code.	Infer fast ion response to given set of modes.	
NOVA-K	Ideal MHD; linear.	Compute eigenfunctions, stability for *AEs.	Improved F_{nb} model. Improved treatment of finite plasma rotation.
M3D-K	Hybrid model; self- consistent, non-linear.	Infer mode dynamics (low-f *AEs, kinks) and fast ion response.	Improved F_{nb} model.
НҮМ	Hybrid model; self- consistent, non-linear.	Infer mode dynamics (high- f *AEs) and fast ion response.	Improved F_{nb} model. Include sources and sinks.
F_{nb} inversion code	Package for analysis of experimental data.	Infer F_{nb} from a set of measurements.	Under development. Adapt to NSTX-U.
QL model	Reduced model for quasi-linear relaxation of F_{nb} .	Compute relaxed $F_{nb}(r)$ in the presence of *AE modes.	Being validated against DIII-D and NSTX data.
Resonant fast ion transport model	Reduced model for resonant/stochastic AE-induced fast ion transport.	Advance F_{nb} in NUBEAM under the effects of resonant *AE modes.	Being included in TRANSP/NUBEAM and validated against NSTX/NSTX-U data.



Non-linear M3D-K simulations of multiple TAEs show mode saturation, frequency chirping D. Liu, G.-Y. Fu



Validation during weakly bursting/chirping phase required before moving to *avalanching* phase

- NSTX scenario with multiple unstable TAEs, n=2-6
- Simulate phase with weakly chirping/bursting TAEs
- Multi-mode simulations retain mode-mode coupling, non-linear effects



🔘 NSTX-U

HYM code analysis shows high-n, co-rotating CAEs coupling to KAWs at high-field side



$$\omega^{2} = k_{\parallel}^{2} V_{A}^{2} \left(1 + \frac{3}{4} \frac{n_{b}}{n_{e}} \lambda_{b} - \frac{n_{b}}{n_{e}} \frac{\omega^{2}}{\omega_{ci}^{2}} \right) \qquad \lambda_{b} = \frac{\mathbf{k}_{\perp}^{2} T_{b}}{m_{i} \omega_{ci}^{2}}$$

- consistent with full kinetic in the limit $\lambda_e \rightarrow 0$, $\lambda_i \rightarrow 0$, and $\omega << \omega_{ci}$.

CAE/KAW coupling may provide an efficient channel for NB power flow to thermal electrons



Radial profiles of δE_{\parallel} and beam ion density for n=4 CAE/KAW.



Radial component of quasilinear Poynting vector **S**=<**E**x**B**>. Energy flux is directed away from magnetic axis, ie from CAE to KAW. Fraction of NBI power transferred to CAE can be estimated as:

 $P=2\gamma \int (\delta B)^2/4\pi \ d^3x,$

where $\delta B/B_0 = (0.9-3.4) \times 10^{-3}$ corresponds to measured displacement $|\xi| = 0.1-0.4$ mm [N.Crocker'13] (based on HYM-calculated linear mode structure for the n=4 CAE).

For γ/ω_{ci} =0.005-0.01, P= (0.013-0.4)MW,

- significant fraction of NBI energy can be transferred to several unstable CAEs of relatively large amplitudes.

Energy flux from the CAE to the KAW and dissipation at the resonance location can have a strong effect on the temperature profile.

() NSTX-U

TORIC and AORSA full-wave codes can be used to simulate antenna-driven modes

- Full wave RF codes retain some effects that can be missing in other EP simulation codes
 - Full linear power absorption by species
 - Full FLR, including $\omega \sim \omega_{ci}$ range
 - Full toroidal geometry
 - Can use a measured or predicted (TRANSP) fast ion distribution (AORSA)
- In addition, TORIC/AORSA provide solutions at very high spatial resolution

- As required for studying KAWs





Detailed mode structure measurements through reflectometry enables quantitative comparison with HYM



Mode structures, density perturbation level used to infer effects on thermal electron transport N. Crocker (UCLA)

- Reflectometer array + Mirnov coils provide δB spectrum, mode structure
 - Density perturbation inferred from phase shift
- Analysis of frequency evolution vs. time used to distinguish between CAEs and GAEs [Crocker, NF 2013]



NSTX-U

Quasi-Linear model computes critical fast ion profile in the presence of unstable TAEs

Evolution of fast ion distribution, modes:

$$\begin{cases} \frac{\partial f}{\partial t} = \sum_{k} \frac{\partial}{\partial P_{\phi}} D_{k}(P_{\phi}) \frac{\partial}{\partial P_{\phi}} f + S \\ \text{where} \quad D(P_{\phi}) \propto W_{k} \delta(\Omega_{k}) \\ \frac{\partial W_{k}}{\partial t} = 2\gamma W_{k} \\ \text{where} \quad \gamma = \gamma_{grth} - \gamma_{dmp} \end{cases}$$

$$\Omega_k = \omega - n\hat{\omega}_\phi + (m+p)\hat{\omega}_\theta$$

At marginal stability: $\gamma_{grth} \rightarrow \gamma_{dmp}$ $\gamma = 0$

• QL model uses analytic expressions for growth, damping rates *vs.* β_{fast} :

$$\gamma_{grth} = \gamma' \frac{\partial \beta}{\partial r}$$

mode number(s), n with $\gamma' \neq \begin{cases} relative mode widths to particle orbit \\ Plasma parameters \end{cases}$

Model being tested for DIII-D, ITER, ARIES, NSTX



 Compute critical conditions on $d\beta_{\text{fast}}/dr$ at each radial position :



(I) NSTX-U

New "kick model" is based on a *probability distribution function* for particle transport



In practice, will use the full 5D matrix for $p(\Delta E, \Delta P_{\xi} | P_{\xi}, E, \mu)$ plus a time-dependent "mode amplitude scaling factor"

Kick model + NUBEAM reproduces fast ion redistribution; NB-driven current strongly affected, too



- NSTX #139048

- Initial tests show fast ion redistribution induced by each TAE avalanche
- Clear effects on NBdriven current, J_{nb}
 - Stronger effect than on F_{nb}
- AE effects persist on slowing down time scales
 - Constant NB injection counteracts F_{nb}, J_{nb}
 depletion
- *Resonance patterns* form in F_{nb}(E,P_ζ,μ)

() NSTX-U

First results from 3 MeV proton measurements in MAST confirm validity of Charged Fusion Product as fast ion diagnostic



Upgraded ssNPA Views a Large Range of Plasma, and Distinguishes Response from Passing & Trapped Beam Ions



- Passing beam ions: **Bay I**
- Trapped beam ions:
 - Bay L for active radial views,
 - Bay B for passive radial views
 - Active cooling is needed at Bay L and Bay B to protect detectors during bake-out
 - Shutter is needed to protect detectors during glow discharges and lithium dropping



New 3D "halo" model in TRANSP enables more accurate interpretation and simulations of charge-exchange-based diagnostics

- "Halo" neutral density can be of same order as NB neutral density
 - Affect quantitative analysis of NPA, FIDA
- "Beam-in-a-box" model encompasses both NB and halo neutrals
 - 3D geometry around NB paths
 - Provides localized halos, contrary to previous model used by TRANSP
- Simulations of E//B NPA signal show importance of 3D halos
 - Total neutrals increase by ~80%
 - Emissivity increases by similar amount
- Model validated against FIDAsim code
- > Broader validation effort is ongoing
 - *e.g., effects of different cross-section libraries* on NB deposition, charge-exchange reactions Comparison of the charge exchange neutral flux time evolution



"Beam-in-box" model for the TRANSP 3D halo neutral code.



for the EIIB NPA sightline with and without 3D halo neutrals.