59th Annual Meeting of the APS DPP, October 2017; Milwaukee, WI

## Numerical simulations of Global Alfven Eigenmode (GAE) stabilization in NSTX-U

E. V. Belova<sup>1</sup>, E. D. Fredrickson<sup>1</sup>, N. A. Crocker<sup>2</sup>, and the NSTX-U team

Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory, Princeton NJ, USA
 University of California, Los Angeles, California 90095, USA





## NSTX-U off-axis neutral beam suppresses Global Alfven Eigenmodes (GAEs) [E. Fredrickson, PRL 2017]



- Counter-propagating GAEs are frequently observed in the sub-cyclotron frequency range of  $0.1f_{ci}$  up to  $0.5f_{ci}$ , in NSTX and NSTX-U.
- Driven by cyclotron resonance with beam ions.
- New neutral beam sources -> ability to control the fast ion distribution.
- Off-axis neutral beams inject fast ions onto trajectories largely parallel to the magnetic field, with pitch  $0.8 < V_{\parallel}/V < 1$ .
- Reliable suppression of the counterpropagating GAE when an additional 1.3MW is injected using the outboard beam.
- GAE stabilization has been well documented for many shots.



# Correlation between strong GAE/CAE activity and flattening of the electron temperature profile has been observed in NSTX [Stutman, PRL 2009]

- Intense GAE/CAE activity (0.5-1.1MHz).
- Flattening of  $T_e$  profile with
  - increased beam power;
  - beam energy scanned between 60 and 90 keV [Stutman, PRL 2009].
- Was attributed to

**√STX-U** 

- enhanced electron transport due to orbit stochasticity in the presence of multiple GAEs [Gorelenkov, NF 2010].
- energy channeling due to CAE coupling to KAW [Belova, PRL 2015].
- Anomalously low T<sub>e</sub> potentially can have significant implications for future fusion devices, especially low aspect ratio tokamaks.



Correlation between GAE activity, T<sub>e</sub> flattening, and central electron heat diffusivity  $\chi_e$  in NSTX H modes with 2, 4, and 6MW neutral beam.



## HYM – HYbrid and MHD code

## Applications

- NSTX
  - Sub-cyclotron frequency Alfven eigenmodes (GAE and CAE)
- ICC Theory and Modeling
  - Hybrid simulations of spheromak merging
  - FRC: Effects of beam ions on stability
    - Rotation control
  - n=2 rotational and n=1 wobble modes

## Code description

- 3-D nonlinear.
- Physical models:
  - Resistive MHD & Hall-MHD
  - Hybrid (fluid electrons, particle ions)
  - MHD/particle (one-fluid thermal plasma, + energetic particle ions)
  - Drift-kinetic particle electrons
- Full-orbit kinetic ions.
- For particles: delta-f / full-f numerical scheme.
- Parallel (3D domain decomposition, MPI)





## Self-consistent MHD + fast ions coupling scheme

Background plasma - fluid:

$$\rho \frac{d\mathbf{V}}{dt} = -\nabla p + (\mathbf{j} - \mathbf{j}_b) \times \mathbf{B} - n_b (\mathbf{E} - \eta \mathbf{j})$$

$$\mathbf{E} = -\mathbf{V} \times \mathbf{B} + \eta \mathbf{j}$$
  

$$\mathbf{B} = \mathbf{B}_0 + \nabla \times \mathbf{A}$$
  

$$\partial \mathbf{A} / \partial t = -\mathbf{E}$$
  

$$\mathbf{j} = \nabla \times \mathbf{B}$$
  

$$\partial p^{1/\gamma} / \partial t = -\nabla \cdot (\mathbf{V} p^{1/\gamma})$$
  

$$\partial \rho / \partial t = -\nabla \cdot (\mathbf{V} \rho)$$

Fast ions – delta-F scheme:

$$\frac{d\mathbf{x}}{dt} = \mathbf{v}$$
$$\frac{d\mathbf{v}}{dt} = \mathbf{E} - \eta \mathbf{j} + \mathbf{v} \times \mathbf{B}$$

 $w = \delta F/F - \text{particle weight}$  $\frac{dw}{dt} = -(1 - w)\frac{d(\ln F_0)}{dt}$  $F_0 = F_0(\varepsilon, \mu, p_\phi)$ 

 $\rho$ , **V** and  $\rho$  are thermal plasma density, velocity and pressure,  $n_b$  and  $j_b$  are beam ion density and current, and  $n_b << n_e - \text{ is assumed}$ .





## Self-consistent anisotropic equilibrium including the NBI ions

Grad-Shafranov equation for two-component plasma: MHD plasma (thermal) and fast ions [Belova et al, Phys. Plasmas 2003].

$$\frac{\partial^2 \psi}{\partial z^2} + R \frac{\partial}{\partial R} \left( \frac{1}{R} \frac{\partial \psi}{\partial R} \right) = -R^2 p' - HH' - GH' + RJ_{b\phi}$$
Beam effects

$$\mathbf{B} = \nabla \phi \times \nabla \psi + h \nabla \phi$$
  

$$h(R,z) = H(\psi) + G(R,z)$$
  

$$\mathbf{J}_{bp} = \nabla G \times \nabla \phi, G - \text{poloidal stream}$$
  
function



Modifications of equilibrium due to beam ions:

- more peaked current profile,
- anisotropic pressure,
- increase in Shafranov shift

might have indirect effect on stability.



## Fast ions – delta-f scheme: $F_0 = F_0(\epsilon, \mu, p_{\phi})$

Equilibrium distribution function  $F_0 = F_1(v) F_2(\lambda) F_3(p_{\varphi}, v)$ 

$$F_{1}(v) = \frac{1}{v^{3} + v_{*}^{3}}, \text{ for } v < v_{0}$$

$$F_{2}(\lambda) = \exp(-(\lambda - \lambda_{0})^{2} / \Delta \lambda^{2})$$

$$F_{3}(p_{\phi}, v) = \frac{(p_{\phi} - p_{0})^{\beta}}{(R_{0}v - \psi_{0} - p_{0})^{\beta}}, \text{ for } p_{\phi} > p_{0}$$

where  $v_0 = 2-5v_A$ ,  $v_* = v_0/2$ ,  $\lambda = \mu B_0/\varepsilon$  – pitch angle parameter,  $\lambda_0 = 0.5-0.7$ , and  $\mu = \mu_0 + \mu_1$  includes first-order corrections [Littlejohn'81]:

$$\mu = \frac{(\mathbf{v}_{\perp} - \mathbf{v}_{\mathbf{d}})^2}{2B} - \frac{\mu_0 v_{\parallel}}{2B} [\hat{b} \cdot \nabla \times \hat{b} - 2(\hat{a} \cdot \nabla \hat{b}) \cdot \hat{c}]$$

 $\mathbf{v}_d$  is magneticgradientand curvatured rift velocity,  $\hat{c} = \mathbf{v}_{\perp} / v_{\perp}$ ,  $\hat{a} = \hat{b} \times \hat{c}$ .

Parameters are chosen to match TRANSP beam profiles.



# HYM simulations reproduce frequency range of unstable GAE and CAE modes observed in NSTX

#### **Experimental analysis:**

Detailed measurements of GAE and CAE amplitudes and mode structure for H-mode plasma in NSTX shot 141398 [N. Crocker, NF 2013].

- **CAEs**: f>600 kHz, and |n|≤5.
- GAEs: f<600 kHz, and |n|~6-8.
- Co- and counter-rotating CAEs with f~1.2-1.8 MHz, and n=6-14 also observed in the same shot [E. Fredrickson, PoP 2013].

#### **HYM simulations:**

- For n=5-7 most unstable are counterrotating GAEs, with f= 380-550 kHz.
- For n=4 and n=8, 9 most unstable are corotating CAEs with f= 870-1200 kHz.



Frequency versus toroidal mode number for unstable GAEs (red) and CAEs (blue), from HYM simulations and experiment,  $f_{ci}$ =2.5MHz.



# Simulations have been performed to study the excitation and stabilization of GAEs in the NSTX-U



(a) Spectrogram on magnetic fluctuations (n=8-11 counter-GAEs).(b) Rms magnetic fluctuations;(c) Injected beam power.

**NSTX-U** 

 Simulations using the HYM code have been performed for NSTX-U shot #204707 right before (t=0.44s) and shortly after (t=0.47s) the additional off-axis beam injection.

• Plasma and beam profiles have been chosen to match TRANSP profiles for t=0.44s and t=0.47s.

• The beam ion distribution function matches TRANSP data, with pitch distribution in the form  $F_b \sim \exp[-(\lambda - \lambda_0(\epsilon))^2 / \Delta \lambda(\epsilon)^2]$ .



Plasma shape, q- and n<sub>b</sub> profiles for NSTX-U shot 204707 t=0.44 from TRANSP and HYM GS solver + FREE\_FIX.



### HYM reproduces experimentally observed unstable GAEs



(a) Spectrogram on magneticfluctuations (n=8-11 counter-GAEs).(b) Rms magnetic fluctuations;(c) Injected beam power.

**NSTX-U** 



(a) Growth rates and (b) frequencies of unstable counter-GAEs from HYM simulations for t=0.44s. Blue line is Doppler-shift corrected frequencies, points – experimental values. • Simulations reproduce most unstable toroidal mode numbers and GAEs frequencies.

• HYM overestimates growth rates compared experimental analysis

• Growth rates are sensitive to distribution function parameters – resonance particles are in 'tail' of distribution.



## NSTX-U simulations: n=10 counter-GAE (t=0.44s)



**NSTX-U** 



## Improved F<sub>beam</sub> fit allows more accurate description



- (a)TRANSP fast-ion distribution before the outboard beam injection t=0.44. Exp. estimated  $\gamma_{dr}$ ~0.5% $\omega_{ci}$  for n=11 GAE;
- (b)HYM fast-ion distribution from n=-10 GAE simulations; dots show resonant particles. Improved  $F_{beam}$  reduces growth rate  $\gamma \sim 1.5\% \omega_{ci}$ .

**NSTX-U** 



- (a)Location of resonant particles in phase space:  $\lambda = \mu B_0 / \epsilon \text{ vs } p_{\phi}$ .
- (b) Particle weight w ~ δF/F vs orbitaveraged parallel velocity. Particle color corresponds to different energies: from E=0 (purple) to E=90keV (red).



## Off-axis beam injection strongly suppresses all unstable GAEs



TRANSP fast-ion distribution before and after the outboard beam injection. Fast ions with pitch  $v_{\parallel}/v\sim1$  are responsible for GAE suppression. Analytical instability condition:  $2 < k_{\perp}\rho_b < 4$ [Gorelenkov,2003].

**NSTX-U** 



Fig. 2. a) color-coded spectrogram showing ctrpropagating GAE activity. Dominant modes are n=-10 (green) and n=-11 (blue). b) green curve is inboard beam power, red curve is off-axis beam power (source 2c).



## HYM simulations reproduce experimental finding: off-axis neutral beam injection reliably and strongly suppresses unstable GAEs

- The beam ion distribution function with pitch distribution in the form  $F_{b} \sim \exp[-(\lambda \lambda_{0}(\epsilon))^{2}/\Delta\lambda(\epsilon)^{2}]$ .
- Additional off-axis beam injection modeled by adding beam ions with distribution  $F_{add} \sim exp[-\lambda^2/\Delta\lambda_a(\epsilon)^2]$ , i.e. with  $\lambda_0=0$ ,  $\Delta\lambda_a<\Delta\lambda$  and about 1/3 of the total beam ion inventory.
- HYM shows complete stabilization of n= 7-12 counter-GAEs by additional off-axis beam injection.



Time evolution of magnetic energy of n=10 GAE from HYM simulations for t=0.44s (red), and t=0.47s (blue).





## Summary and Future Work

- HYM simulations show range of toroidal mode numbers, and frequencies of unstable GAEs that match the experimentally observed GAEs in NSTX-U.
- Growth rate of GAE is sensitive to details of beam ion distribution.
- Simulations reproduce experimental finding, namely it is shown that off-axis neutral beam injection reliably and strongly suppresses all unstable GAEs.
- A robust physical mechanism for stabilizing GAEs threshold for stabilization for additional beam is less than 25% of total beam power.

Future work:

- Understanding instability conditions for excitation of counter-GAEs comparison with analytical condition.
- Bulk plasma rotation and Hall term can have effect on GAE stability and mode structure.
- Comparison with experimental results including mode structure, saturation amplitudes and etc for several shots.



